IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA

WEST PALM BEACH, FLORIDA

CIVIL NO. 9:16-CV81612-MARRA

MALIK LEIGH, ESQ.,
Plaintiff,

vs.

ROBERT AVOSSA, CHERYL MCKEEVER, CAMILLE COLEMAN, DIANNE WEINBAUM, ELVIS EPPS, DAVID CHRISTIANSEN, DARRON DAVIS, JOSEPH LEE (in their individual and official capacities), PALM BEACH COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT (BOARD),

Defendants.

______/

DEPOSITION OF ROBERT AVOSSA, ED.D., A DEFENDANT TAKEN BY THE PLAINTIFF

VOLUME II

DATE: June 8, 2017

TIME: 12:25 - 1:49 p.m.

```
1
               IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
                   SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA
 2
                     WEST PALM BEACH, FLORIDA
                   CIVIL NO. 9:16-CV-81624-KAM
 3
 4
 5
 6
 7
      RAQUEL ABRAMS-JACKSON,
                 Plaintiff,
 8
      vs.
9
      ROBERT AVOSSA, CHERYL MCKEEVER,
      (in their individual
10
      capacities), SCHOOL BOARD OF
11
     PALM BEACH COUNTY,
                 Defendants.
12
13
14
15
16
17
             DEPOSITION OF ROBERT AVOSSA, ED.D.,
18
                        A DEFENDANT
                   TAKEN BY THE PLAINTIFF
19
20
                          VOLUME II
21
22
23
     DATE: June 8, 2017
24
     TIME: 12:25 - 1:40 p.m.
25
```

1	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2	SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA WEST PALM BEACH, FLORIDA
3	CIVIL NO. 9:16-CV-81623-RLR
4	
5	
6	
7	LORETTA PARISH-CARTER,
8	Plaintiff,
9	vs.
10	ROBERT AVOSSA, CHERYL MCKEEVER, (in their individual
11	capacities), SCHOOL BOARD OF PALM BEACH COUNTY,
12	Defendants.
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	DEPOSITION OF ROBERT AVOSSA, ED.D., A DEFENDANT
19	TAKEN BY THE PLAINTIFF
20	VOLUME II
21	
22	
23	DATE: June 8, 2017
24	TIME: 12:25 - 1:40 p.m.
25	-

```
1
                          I-N-D-E-X
     June 8, 2017
 2
     ROBERT AVOSSA, ED.D.
 3
 4
                     DIRECT CROSS REDIRECT RECROSS
 5
     By Mr. Leigh
                       6
 6
     By Ms. Bernard
 7
 8
 9
                           EXHIBITS
10
11
                                                 Identified
12
     Plaintiff's Exhibit 1
                                                     85
       Leigh letter (undated)
13
14
15
16
17
18
     Letter to Shawntoyia Bernard, Esq.
     Errata Sheets (to be forwarded upon completion)
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

1	The deposition of ROBERT AVOSSA,
2	ED.D., a Defendant in the above-entitled and
3	numbered cause was taken by me, Ann Marie
4	Pleasanton, Registered Professional Reporter,
5	Florida Professional Reporter, at Boca Raton High
6	School, 1501 NW 15th Court, Boca Raton, Florida,
7	on Thursday, the 8th day of June, 2017, pursuant
8	to Notices in said cause for the taking of said
9	deposition on behalf of the Plaintiffs.
10	
11	APPEARING ON BEHALF OF PLAINTIFFS:
12	Malik Leigh, Esq.
13	Danielle Watson, Esq. WATSON LEIGH LAW AND EDUCATION
	SERVICES GROUP
14	P.O. Box 221172
15	West Palm Beach Florida 33422
16	
17	APPEARING ON BEHALF OF DEFENDANTS:
	Shawntoyia Bernard, Esq.
18	SCHOOL BOARD OF PALM BEACH COUNTY
	3300 Forest Hill Boulevard
19	Suite C-323 West Palm Beach Florida 33406
20	West fulli Beach fielda 33400
21	
22	ALSO PRESENT: Det. Ken Clark, PBC School District Police
23	
24	
25	

- 1 By MR. LEIGH:
- Q. Going back to progressive punishment,
- 3 you're familiar with all of the situations and/or
- 4 issues that involved Malik Leigh's termination;
- 5 is that correct?
- 6 A. Not all of them.
- 7 Q. What issues or -- describe what you do
- 8 know then.
- 9 A. So what I know is that Malik is a -- was
- 10 a probationary teacher and that the issues that
- 11 you brought forward about having attended with
- 12 the kids, the meeting... you know, that you had
- 13 come to the meeting -- you're asking me in
- 14 general what I know?
- 15 Let me make sure I understand the
- 16 question.
- 17 Q. Yeah.
- 18 Not so much about him or me -- I'm
- 19 trying to use it in the third person -- you can
- 20 say it however you want to -- but not so much him
- 21 in general, but the events that led to his
- 22 termination.
- A. So, as I understand it, that there had
- 24 been a variety of different issues and concerns
- 25 throughout the first year.

```
1
         Q.
              Okay.
              What was the first one?
 2
              I don't know.
 3
         Α.
              What was the second one?
 4
         0.
              I don't know.
                              There were a series of
 5
         Α.
 6
     issues and concerns that the principal had with
 7
     you and that they chose not to renew you because
     you were a probationary employee.
 8
              So I don't know all the details.
 9
                                                 If you
10
     would like that, you would have to ask HR.
11
              So you don't know if he had ever been
         0.
12
     written up?
13
         Α.
              I don't know that.
14
              So you're saying this is all generated
15
     between some kind of issue, in quotes, between
16
     him and the principal?
17
         Α.
              No.
18
              As I understand it, a variety of
19
     different issues and concerns that have come up
20
     for a probationary period and they decided just
21
     not to renew.
22
              Okay, all right.
         Q.
23
              And do you know whether or not Malik had
24
     ever been accused of misconduct?
25
              I have no idea.
         Α.
```

- 1 Q. Would you say that... do you know
- 2 whether or not he violated the stated curriculum
- 3 of the course that he taught?
- 4 A. I have no idea.
- 5 Q. You don't know, okay.
- 6 Do you know whether or not the law
- 7 course or the Law Academy has a set curriculum?
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. Do you know whether or not Malik Leigh
- 10 was given any particular instruction on how to
- 11 teach that course?
- 12 A. I have no idea.
- 13 Q. Do you know -- you stated a second ago
- 14 that you don't like how he fashioned his exam
- 15 question, but you don't know of any policy that
- 16 speaks against it?
- MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 18 A. So I don't like when any teacher uses
- 19 their position in a way to evoke or be a
- 20 provocateur around political issues that have no
- 21 business in the K through 12 institution.
- Q. Do you think that Malik Leigh was trying
- 23 to oppress upon his students his political
- 24 beliefs?
- 25 A. When all the responses of one particular

- 1 question that comes to mind -- there were several
- 2 that seemed out of place and inappropriate, --
- Q. Okay.
- 4 A. -- but the one about Donald Trump, all
- 5 four of the responses were negative.
- 6 Q. Okay.
- 7 A. Which meant to me that the individual
- 8 who put that question on the test knew the answer
- 9 had to be that we were screwed, because all of
- 10 the responses were the same.
- 11 Q. So my question is: Do you think that
- 12 Malik Leigh was trying to oppress upon his
- 13 students his political beliefs?
- 14 A. You would have to ask yourself that
- 15 question.
- 16
 It appeared to me as an inappropriate,
- 17 immature question that shouldn't have been in --
- 18 on a test.
- 19 Q. But you can't speak to any school policy
- 20 or School Board policy that speaks against being
- 21 able to have that question on the exam?
- MS. BERNARD: Object to the form; asked
- 23 and answered.
- 24 You can try it again.
- 25 A. I don't know of any.

- 1 But there are lots of ethical guidelines
- 2 that are part of a commitment you make when you
- 3 become a teacher that you have to follow.
- 4 And so I think there was some of that
- 5 that -- whether it's in policy or not, you would
- 6 have to ask our policy people.
- Q. Okay.
- 8 Do you know whether or not that exam was
- 9 given to any of the students?
- 10 A. I have no idea.
- 11 Q. You also stated in your -- one of your
- 12 tv or newspaper interviews that at the beginning
- 13 of the year you sent out an e-mail to all the
- 14 teachers and students -- excuse me, to all of the
- 15 teachers -- to stay away from political topics in
- 16 their exams and their course work.
- Do you remember that?
- 18 A. No, I don't remember that.
- 19 Q. You don't remember saying that?
- 20 A. (Nods head.)
- Q. Do you remember doing that?
- 22 A. We talked to principals and I talked to
- 23 staff about a variety of issues and politics,
- 24 certainly given the nature of this past political
- 25 season, we knew that things were heating up and

- 1 we actually started seeing issues before, during
- 2 and after all of the political chaos that
- 3 occurred and after the election in particular.
- 4 Q. Okay.
- 5 A. So there are a variety of different ways
- 6 that information is disseminated to staff and
- 7 faculty to stay away from --
- Q. Okay.
- 9 A. -- about political viewpoints that
- 10 people hold.
- 11 Q. Is the topic of race a political topic?
- 12 A. Is the topic of race a political
- 13 topic...
- 14 Q. Discussing race, would that be --
- 15 A. No, this is a political season that
- 16 we're talking about candidates.
- 17 I think race can become a political
- 18 issue, but it's not the same thing as a political
- 19 race -- meaning... I'm sorry for the... political
- 20 season.
- 21 Q. Sure, okay.
- 22 So discussing... so discussing race in a
- 23 class -- obviously you don't -- discussing race
- in a math class would be out of place, correct?
- 25 A. I don't know that.

```
1
             I mean, if a teacher found a way to
   weave in a discussion that was culturally -- that
2
    showed cultural competence and understanding,
3
4
    there may be.
5
             I mean, there's black mathematicians
6
    that might have discovered something interesting
7
    and the principal -- or, I mean, I'm sorry, the
    teacher may want to bring that up during Black
8
9
    History Month or -- I don't know... it depends.
```

- 10 Q. Okay, all right.
- 11 So the context really matters?
- 12 A. I think so.
- 13 Q. Okay.
- And if a parent complained about a
 question that was, you know, name one of the
 three black women -- say it's February, name one
 of the three black women that were part of the
 NASA space program that helped whoever it was get
 to the moon and back.
- 20 And say a parent, black or white, had a 21 problem with that question, called the school, 22 what should happen?
- MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 24 THE WITNESS: Can I answer it?
- MS. BERNARD: Yes. I'm sorry, yes.

```
    Q. Yes.
    A. So the
```

- 2 A. So the first thing I would ask is 3 what -- how does that question relate to the
- 4 curriculum that's being taught.
- Q. Okay.
- A. So, for example, if the discussion was
- 7 in science, then I think it's appropriate that
- 8 individuals speak about the calculations that
- 9 were developed by those women during the space
- 10 race.
- So I think that's appropriate.
- 12 Q. Okay.
- 13 A. We have found periodically questions --
- 14 and not just here, around the nation you see it
- 15 -- where people try to infuse topics of race in
- 16 inappropriate ways and examples that are just
- 17 completely inappropriate.
- 18 Q. Sure, right.
- So in a law class, discussing political
- 20 topics in and of themselves isn't -- would be an
- 21 appropriate place to discuss that, right?
- 22 A. It could be, it could be.
- 23 Q. Because generally all things politics --
- 24 are derived from law?
- MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.

```
1 A. What I would say is this: I think
```

- 2 there's an appropriate place for conversations to
- 3 be had, debates to occur. And, again, with
- 4 teachers being very careful not to let their own
- 5 personal bias interfere with their teaching.
- 6 Q. Okay.
- 7 But you said you were not -- or I'm not
- 8 sure if I asked this, so I will ask it again just
- 9 in case -- you were not aware of any particular
- 10 findings of any investigation that was launched
- 11 about this exam?
- 12 A. No.
- I -- you know, again, we rely on our HR
- 14 professionals to conduct those, those
- 15 investigations. You would have to ask them.
- 16 Q. So if someone gave you either wrong, bad
- or incomplete information and you spoke about it
- 18 on tv, whose responsibility is it to clear up
- 19 that incorrect statement?
- MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 21 A. We provide statements to the press
- 22 regularly about a variety of different topics.
- 23 If there's something that is
- 24 misinformation... for example, if I were to say
- 25 the budget is being cut a hundred and twenty

- 1 million dollars and I accidently said a hundred
- 2 and twenty million dollars and it was actually
- 3 twenty million dollars, then, you know, I would
- 4 try to make sure that folks knew that, you know,
- 5 that number was wrong that we sent.
- 6 Q. But say, for example, teacher at Palm
- 7 Beach Gardens who was named X and Y was found to
- 8 have -- was found to have stolen money, but it
- 9 was reported in an interview by you that you said
- 10 it was YX, whose responsibility is it -- because
- 11 that's how it was presented to you -- whose
- 12 responsibility is it to make sure that that name
- 13 correction is made, because that information that
- 14 was given to you was incorrect?
- MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 16 A. I'm not sure I really understand the
- 17 question.
- 18 Q. You stated previously that you speak on
- 19 a variety of topics to the news and the
- 20 newspaper, right?
- 21 A. (Nods head.)
- 22 Q. Now, when you speak to the news or
- 23 newspaper, you tend to -- even though you invoke
- 24 yourself, you're saying it as "we." So you're
- 25 speaking in terms of someone told you something,

- 1 but you give the information as "I," because the
- 2 buck still stops with you, but so you give the
- 3 information with "I" when -- and only you know
- 4 this -- but you mean "we" collectively, right?
- 5 So when the "we" gives you information
- 6 that's incorrect and you say something to the
- 7 press that is based upon that incorrect
- 8 information, whose responsibility is it to give
- 9 the press the correct information?
- MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 11 A. So if we purposefully or knowingly --
- 12 Q. If you, you.
- 13 A. If I on behalf of School District give
- 14 instruction that's incorrect?
- 15 O. Uh-huh.
- 16 A. I would have no issue issuing a
- 17 statement clarifying any misinformation that we
- 18 had provided.
- 19 O. Okay.
- So as it relates to your statement about
- 21 receiving exams, you know, about you getting
- 22 reports of problems with Malik Leigh's previous
- 23 exams and assignments all year, if it's found
- 24 that that was not the case, then whose
- 25 responsibility would it be to correct that?

- 1 MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 2 A. To correct it in what way?
- 3 Q. Well, you yourself said you have never
- 4 seen any of his -- any of Malik Leigh's previous
- 5 exams or assignments, correct?
- 6 A. Well I said, I remember seeing the...
- 7 O. The final?
- 8 A. Right.
- 9 Q. But the issue that you were referring
- 10 to, the topic that was going on at the time was
- 11 about the final exam.
- 12 A. Right. So I have to rely on staff to
- 13 provide information and then I relay that
- 14 information on behalf of the School District.
- 15 Q. Okay.
- 16 So you're basically saying that someone
- 17 told you that there had been previous problems or
- 18 problems with his previous exams and assignments?
- 19 A. The investigators provide talking points
- 20 with me and our PR folks and then we issue a
- 21 statement.
- 22 Sometimes I speak on the statement.
- 23 Sometimes we release written statements. And
- 24 sometimes there's interviews, depending on the
- 25 media type.

```
If information is incorrect and it's
 1
     found to be incorrect... let's say, for example,
 2
     at the end of a situation with a teacher, they
 3
     had been accused of stealing money, I have to
 4
 5
     say, look, this individual is being accused of
     stealing money, we're doing an investigation and,
 6
 7
     you know, it appears as though they stole the
     money, but we have to wait and see what the final
 8
     information is at the end of a trial or whatever.
 9
10
              Then at the end of the trial, if he or
11
     she is found guilty or not guilty, then, of
12
     course, you know, that information, we would have
13
     to say, look, clearly we weren't able to find
14
     enough evidence to support the claim that we had
15
     that we thought that this individual had stolen
16
    money and we would have to report that back out.
17
              So does anybody else know that when you
         Ο.
18
     say "I" that you're speaking about the whole
19
     District or...
20
                            Object to the form.
              MS. BERNARD:
21
         Α.
              Does anybody else know...
22
              So I don't know. I can't speak for
23
     everybody else.
24
              But, you know, folks know that I speak
```

25

on behalf of the District.

```
I don't know about every single issue in
 1
     a situation, just like any other CEO of a
 2
 3
     company --
             In this situation then?
 4
         Ο.
 5
         Α.
              -- of any other company.
              So, for example, the CEO of Ford Motor
 6
 7
     Company makes a decision and says, you know, I'm
     excited to share this news about Ford Motor
 8
 9
     Company, he's speaking on behalf of his
10
     organization, just like I do.
11
         0.
              Okay.
12
              And so you --
13
         Α.
              So in this situation, I'm speaking on
14
     behalf of the Board, which the Board means the
15
     school system and the folks who, you know, were
16
     dealing with this issue.
17
              So before you say something, you do not
18
     research the veracity or falsity of the
19
     statement?
20
              MS. BERNARD:
                            Object to the form;
21
         mischaracterizations the prior testimony.
22
              You can try again.
23
              So we have got professionals that are
         Α.
     objective, they are trained, they work in HR,
24
25
     they collect information, they make their case,
```

- 1 they bring it to their teams, they bring it to me
- 2 and then we move forward with it.
- 3 So you have got an opinion on whether or
- 4 not individuals, you know, have shared one thing
- 5 one way and then we have got opinions and ideas
- 6 and facts that show it another way.
- 7 Q. Okay, but my question -- that's
- 8 something completely different.
- 9 My question is: Before you speak on
- 10 behalf of the School District -- okay?
- 11 A. Right.
- 12 Q. -- based upon information that someone
- 13 else gave you, okay, that makes up your talking
- 14 points, do you independently, you, yourself,
- 15 Robert Avossa, verify that information to be
- 16 correct or incorrect?
- A. So they come to me, usually I have got
- 18 standing meetings about personnel matters, we
- 19 have the legal team, the HR team, we walk through
- 20 every single case. They have their evidence with
- 21 them. They share what they have done.
- We also have other committees that
- 23 review many of these processes.
- It depends on which... the level of
- 25 issues.

```
1
              So, for example, sometimes even cases
     are brought to our EOC team like it's called,
 2
     like a group of peers. We will bring an issue to
 3
     a group of peers, they help weigh in on it,
 4
 5
     depends on the group.
 6
              So they will come to me and say, okay,
 7
     today we're going to talk about the Malik Leigh
            And they will walk me through and show me
 8
     sort of where we are with the thing or we have
 9
10
    made a final decision, we're not going to renew
     this individual or they are going to be a
11
12
     thirty-day suspension.
13
              And then we will take that and create a
14
     few talking points and share them.
15
              How quick after any particular incident
         Q.
16
     does that meeting take place, generally?
17
              MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
18
         Α.
              It depends.
19
              Sometimes --
20
         Q.
              In this situation?
21
         Α.
              I have no idea, yeah.
22
              Was it -- would you say that you had
         Ο.
23
     that meeting within twenty-four hours of --
24
         Α.
              No, no, no.
```

These things take way longer than that.

25

- 1 I don't even remember any case that was even
- 2 close to twenty-four hours.
- 3 Q. Okay.
- 4 A. And a lot of this also depends on how
- 5 the individual -- in this case, you -- how you go
- 6 about dealing with the media and bringing
- 7 attention to the issue yourself. And that causes
- 8 the District to have to make comments about
- 9 investigations.
- 10 We typically don't like to do that.
- 11 But when an individual, whose maybe the
- 12 focus of the investigation, decides to go to the
- 13 media, then, you know -- because I really
- 14 personally would prefer always not to deal with
- 15 that.
- 16 Q. Okay.
- 17 Well, Malik Leigh was suspended on May
- 18 the 18th, 2016.
- 19 The statements that you made were on May
- 20 the 19th of 2016, where you stated that you had
- 21 received information or you had received word
- 22 that there were problems with prior exams and
- 23 assignments.
- So you're telling me that no meeting had
- 25 taken place within that twenty-four hours, so how

```
1
     were you able to make that statement?
 2
              MS. BERNARD:
                             Object.
         Α.
              Hold on a second.
 3
              MS. BERNARD: Lack of foundation.
 4
              You asked me a question, does it -- did
 5
         Α.
     -- so you're talking about suspension, right?
 6
 7
              The example I'm giving you is the fact
     that a case investigation, right, may take much
 8
 9
     longer than twenty-four hours.
10
              So you're saying that you were suspended
11
     and then I made a statement after twenty-four
12
     hours.
13
              Isn't that what you just said or asked
14
     me?
15
              It was within twenty-four hours,
         Q.
16
     correct.
17
         Α.
              Right.
18
              So there's a lot of things that happened
19
     before the decision to make a suspension.
20
              Does that make sense?
21
         Q.
              Sure.
22
              So then that group is responsible for
23
     those bits and pieces of collection.
24
              Then once the decision is made about,
```

hey, we're going to wind up having to suspend

25

- 1 this individual, then, you know, I will make a
- 2 statement about sort of what's happening or why.
- In some cases, again, when individuals,
- 4 rather than run to the media, work with us, we
- 5 might remove a teacher put them in the
- 6 transportation department until that
- 7 investigation has been completed.
- 8 Sometimes the suspension is home with
- 9 pay.
- 10 Sometimes -- again, there's a variety of
- 11 different things that are available to us.
- 12 Q. Do you know how many of Malik Leigh's
- previous -- you said that all exams had to be
- 14 turned in for approval, correct?
- 15 A. I said that most principals require,
- 16 particularly in high school, that teachers either
- 17 give to their department chairs or the principal,
- 18 depending on the school, what their final exam
- 19 is.
- 20 Q. Okay.
- 21 A. So a lot of that is also because
- 22 sometimes parents come back, I want to see the
- 23 exam. There's a lot of reasons, not just to
- 24 micromanage teachers, although there are times
- 25 when teachers are low performers or have had a

- 1 history of making bad decisions about tests and
- 2 the principal says, I want to see every one of
- 3 your tests.
- 4 Q. Do you know of any of Malik Leigh's
- 5 prior exams or assignments that were not
- 6 approved?
- 7 A. I have no idea about that. I could not
- 8 -- I couldn't answer that question.
- 9 Q. Do you know Malik Leigh's progressive
- 10 and final evaluation score?
- 11 A. Nope.
- 12 Q. Do you know Malik Leigh's disciplinary
- 13 history over the course of the year?
- 14 A. No, no.
- 15 Again, I will say it probably for the
- 16 third or fourth time, we have twenty-two thousand
- 17 employees. I know this is a very important case
- 18 to you and it is important to me, any time we
- 19 part ways with individuals, it's upsetting. I
- 20 don't as an individual ever want to see that.
- 21 Unfortunately, I don't know the intimate details
- 22 of every one of those issues.
- 23 Q. Have you spoken on twenty-two thousand
- 24 of your employees over the course of a year?
- 25 A. Have I spoken to them?

```
1 Q. Spoken on. Spoken about.
```

- 2 A. About them?
- 3 Q. Uh-huh.
- 4 MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 5 A. No.
- 6 Q. So over the course of 2015 and 2016, how
- 7 many teachers had you spoken on specifically in
- 8 the news?
- 9 A. I have no idea. A dozen each year. Two
- 10 dozen. I don't know. I mean, it depends.
- 11 There's so much more to the work than just the
- 12 teaching and learning. I wish that's all we ever
- 13 did. But, unfortunately, this job entails
- 14 significantly more than that.
- 15 Q. Okay, okay.
- 16 And in that job, verifying information
- 17 that you disseminate to the media, however they
- 18 come to you, is secondary or tertiary?
- 19 MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 20 A. It's important.
- 21 And, again, you know, I meet with the
- leaders who are content experts in the field and
- 23 we walk through where they are. And I have --
- 24 you know, I have got to make statements on behalf
- 25 of the District and I do.

```
1
              It is not an easy thing, I don't enjoy
     it, but it's part of the job.
 2
              Are you familiar with the term colorism?
 3
         0.
         Α.
              Colorism?
 4
 5
         Ο.
              Yes.
 6
         Α.
              No.
 7
         Q.
              You stated previously that you did not
     know Raquel Abrams-Jackson, correct?
 8
              Yeah, I mean -- no, I don't know her.
 9
         Α.
10
              Not like personally?
         Ο.
11
              No, I don't know her.
         Α.
12
              And if Raquel walked in and you said,
13
     this was Raquel, I would have no idea.
14
              But if you saw me again out on the
15
     street you would recognize me, right?
16
              Yeah, I would recognize you.
         Α.
17
              Prior to today, if you saw me on the
         Q.
     street would you recognize me?
18
19
         Α.
              Yeah.
20
              Do I look significantly different from
     the first time that you saw me versus now?
21
22
         Α.
              No.
23
              I think maybe your beard is a little bit
24
             Maybe a little bit grayer.
     longer.
25
              It is actually less grayer.
         Q.
```

```
1
              (Laughter.)
              So are you aware of any part of Raquel
 2
     Abrams-Jackson's involuntary transfer from Lake
 3
     Shore elementary school to Palm Beach Lakes?
 4
 5
         Α.
              No.
              I mean, we, we move teachers...
 6
     sometimes teachers ask to be moved.
 7
 8
              And some teachers have rights to be
     moved.
 9
10
              Others just say, this just isn't working
     or I'm too far away from home or whatever.
11
12
              There are a lot of moving parts there.
13
              I don't recall that.
14
              Are you aware that in November of 2014
15
     Raquel Abrams-Jackson called the administrative
16
     office and complained about harassment by the
17
     principal at Lake Shore elementary?
18
              Of Lake Shore elementary school?
19
     don't think we even have a Lake Shore elementary.
20
         Q.
              Excuse me, Lake Shore Middle.
21
              I meant Lake Shore Middle.
22
              No, I'm not familiar with that.
         Α.
23
              I had -- I didn't start working here
     until about a year after that date.
24
25
              So in September of 2015, do you remember
         Q.
```

- 1 her writing a letter to the School Board and
- 2 yourself regarding the issues at Palm Beach Lakes
- 3 High School?
- 4 A. I don't -- I can't -- I don't remember a
- 5 letter from her.
- 6 Q. Is it possible that that was one of the
- 7 letters you received of the many --
- 8 A. Yeah.
- 9 Well, I mean, what I knew about the high
- 10 school at Palm Beach Lakes High School was that
- 11 there were complaints coming in because the union
- 12 member brought it to my attention, the president.
- 13 Q. Okay.
- 14 A. And she said we're having problems at
- 15 the school. And she never gave me specifics. It
- 16 was always like things like teacher morale...
- 17 the teachers, you know, aren't happy... there's
- 18 a lot of complaints.
- 19 And so we have got a set of practices
- 20 that we use to try to get at the heart of what's
- 21 happening at the school.
- That matters to me.
- 23 Q. Okay.
- 24 Do you or are you aware or recall that
- on November the 19th, 2015 that Cheryl McKeever

```
gave Raquel Abrams-Jackson a Cease and Desist
 1
     letter?
 2
         Α.
              No.
 3
              You mean that she got fired?
 4
 5
         Q.
              No, she just wrote her a Cease and
 6
     Desist letter.
 7
         Α.
              No, I'm not aware of that.
 8
         Q.
              Are principals allowed to do that?
              I don't know.
 9
         Α.
              I will have to find out.
10
              Have you ever given a Cease and Desist
11
         Q.
     letter as a teacher?
12
13
         Α.
              But in what context?
14
              Was the person doing something that we
15
     asked her to stop doing?
16
              I mean, I can't answer that.
         Ο.
17
              I don't know.
         Α.
18
              I'm not aware of the principal doing
19
     that.
20
              Are you aware that she filed a
21
     discrimination charge against -- on November
22
     the 13th, 2015 that she filed a discrimination
23
     charge, an EEO with the Palm Beach County School
24
     District --
              Who is "she"? The principal?
25
```

```
1 Q. Raquel Abrams-Jackson.
```

- 2 A. That she filed a complaint?
- 3 Q. Uh-huh.
- With the EEO office, with Deneen
- 5 Wellings.
- 6 A. No, I'm not familiar with that.
- 7 Q. And then you are, though, aware that on
- 8 November the 17th, 2015, that she went to the
- 9 School Board meeting and read allowed a letter
- 10 from the other teachers speaking about the issues
- 11 going on at Palm Beach Lakes?
- MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 13 Mischaracterizes prior testimony.
- 14 Q. You are aware that Ms. Raquel
- 15 Abrams-Jackson came to the School Board meeting
- 16 and spoke with yourself and the School Board?
- 17 MS. BERNARD: Same objection.
- 18 A. So I don't remember -- like I said it
- 19 before, if you put her in a room and said, which
- 20 one is Raquel, I wouldn't know that.
- 21 O. Okay.
- 22 A. I do remember... you know, teachers
- 23 come and talk about different schools and their
- 24 concerns at the schools.
- Q. Is it normal policy for people that

- 1 speak during the non-agenda time to be stopped
- 2 and escorted out of the Board meeting, the School
- 3 Board room?
- 4 A. So we have a practice -- one of the
- 5 reasons people typically come to the School Board
- 6 is that they feel like their voice, their concern
- 7 hasn't been addressed.
- 8 So it is not uncommon for staff to walk
- 9 out with someone and say, look, I'm sorry you're
- 10 feeling this way. Help me understand what
- 11 happened. Let me get your phone number. Let's
- 12 try to resolve the issue. So that is not
- 13 uncommon.
- I know that, you know, I have read
- 15 articles, particularly in Miami-Dade, where there
- 16 was some recent buzz about the fact that... we
- 17 even, you know -- and in this case this
- 18 particular article talked about when people sign
- 19 up, sometimes the people say, well, what is it
- 20 that you want to talk about, right, so we can
- 21 write down what the topic is. And they didn't
- 22 like the fact that those people were asking that.
- Because we ask that, too, we say, well,
- 24 what is it that you would like to talk about.
- 25 Sometimes people will say I would like to talk

- 1 about a complaint. Well, have you talked to the
- 2 principal yet? Because sometimes the issue can
- 3 be resolved, right, because sometimes people
- 4 don't know where to go.
- 5 But we always tell them and we have it
- 6 clearly written out what they are supposed to
- 7 say. And if someone says, I don't want to tell
- 8 you, that's fine, just give me your name and we
- 9 will put you on the list.
- 10 Q. Were you aware that the escort was Mr.
- 11 Christiansen?
- MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 13 A. I don't know.
- Dr. Christiansen is the deputy
- 15 superintendent. It's not uncommon for any of the
- 16 leadership that's there to walk out with and talk
- 17 with individuals who are there who have been
- 18 upset or concerned. That's part of our
- 19 responsibility. They have come and they have
- 20 shared something negative.
- 21 And now we will say, all right, let's
- 22 figure out what's going on. Maybe we haven't
- 23 heard that before. Maybe it's new to us, right?
- A parent might come in and make a
- 25 complaint about their IEP not being followed and

- 1 it went from something at the school all the way
- 2 up to the Board, let's try to figure out how to
- 3 help this mom solve the issue.
- 4 Q. Were you aware that he had told her in a
- 5 room full of people that she had been a problem
- 6 at her previous school?
- 7 A. No, I'm not aware of that.
- 8 Q. Are you aware that on December the 10th,
- 9 2015, that Cheryl McKeever read aloud portions of
- 10 a letter that was disparaging to her staff?
- 11 A. I'm not aware of that.
- 12 Q. And that letter was actually the
- 13 grievance letter that Raquel Abrams-Jackson had
- 14 filed?
- 15 A. So just so I'm clear with your question,
- 16 you're saying am I aware that the principal read
- 17 a letter that was written to her, the principal,
- 18 that was disparaging about her or about the
- 19 staff?
- 20 Q. No, no.
- 21 Are you aware that Cheryl McKeever read
- 22 a letter, which was the grievance letter that
- 23 Raquel Abrams-Jackson had filed, aloud to all of
- 24 the staff in a staff meeting?
- 25 A. I'm not aware of that. I don't know

```
1
     that to be true.
         Q.
              Okay.
 2
              Are you aware that on December the 11th,
 3
     2015, that she filed a second EEO discrimination
 4
 5
     charge with the Palm Beach County School District
 6
     EEO office?
 7
              MS. BERNARD: Just for clarification,
         who is the "she"?
 8
 9
              MR. LEIGH: Raquel Abrams-Jackson.
10
         These are all about Raquel Abrams-Jackson.
11
              MS. BERNARD: This is all Raquel, okay.
12
         Α.
              No.
13
              Were you aware that on January the 6th,
14
     2016, that there was grievance filed by the
15
     entire staff at Palm Beach Lakes against Cheryl
16
    McKeever and her administration -- her APs and
17
     staff?
18
         Α.
              I'm not aware of a formal grievance.
19
              I knew, again, in talking with the union
20
     that things were getting bad at the school.
21
              I don't know -- again, I don't get
22
     involved in the day-to-day operations of an
23
     individual school.
24
              Do you remember at what time of the year
         Ο.
25
     that that conversation occurred?
```

- 1 A. It was almost every month that I met
- 2 with the union, Palm Beach Lakes was on their
- 3 list.
- Q. And so every month did you seek out to
- 5 find out what the deal was?
- 6 A. It depends. So it's progressive.
- 7 So, in the beginning, you know, the
- 8 union had very vague sort of feedback. But they
- 9 said they wanted to dig into it, wanted to spend
- 10 some time there.
- If I remember right, I think they even
- 12 did some sort of survey to the teachers that was
- anonymous that the union managed.
- 14 Q. Okay.
- 15 A. And then I remember getting some help
- 16 for the principal to try to unpack how to try to
- 17 help turn the ship around because it seemed like
- 18 culturally, even though some student achievement
- 19 data was going up, that things seemed to be
- 20 getting toxic.
- I'm using the words that the union
- 22 shared with me.
- 23 O. Sure.
- A. So it seemed to have gotten a little bit
- 25 worse, but never did -- the union usually doesn't

- 1 come in and say this teacher has this issue with
- 2 the principal. Like they have their own path to
- 3 file grievances.
- 4 What they come and talk with me about is
- 5 the thirty thousand foot level.
- 6 0. Sure.
- 7 A. We have got five or ten legitimate
- 8 cultural issues going on at this school. We have
- 9 got these three things that are bad.
- 10 But they don't ever say, you know, Malik
- 11 Leigh has said this about the principal. It's
- 12 always very generic.
- 13 O. Sure.
- 14 Were you aware that on May the 18th,
- 15 Cheryl McKeever had written up Raquel
- 16 Abrams-Jackson regarding an issue with a student?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 Q. Were you aware that on May 25th, 2016,
- 19 that Raguel Abrams-Jackson filed a discrimination
- 20 and retaliation charge with the EEOC in Miami?
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. On March the 9th, 2017, were you made
- 23 aware that Raquel Abrams-Jackson was notified
- 24 that her Florida Department of Education teaching
- 25 certificate had been negatively affected by the

```
School District?
 1
              I don't even know what that means,
 2
     "negatively affected."
 3
              Did she have it revoked?
 4
 5
         Q.
              No, no, no.
              That there was submission made on behalf
 6
 7
     of her teaching certificate.
 8
         Α.
              No.
 9
              Were you aware -- as it relates to
         Q.
10
     Loretta Parish-Carter, were aware that on
     November 14th she had lost wages and filed a
11
12
     grievance report against Cheryl McKeever?
13
         Α.
              No.
14
              Were you aware that at the beginning of
15
     2015 she lost her chair position without notice
16
     to two white less-qualified teachers?
17
              No, I wasn't aware, except what you said
         Α.
18
     today.
19
              Were you aware that in November of 2015
         Q.
20
     she filed her -- she filed a racial
21
     discrimination charge with the Palm Beach County
22
     School District, the EEO office?
23
         Α.
              No.
24
              Were you also aware that none of the
     witnesses in that EEO charge were ever
25
```

```
1
     investigated, were ever questioned by Deneen
     Wellings?
 2
 3
         Α.
              No.
 4
              But your question was wrong. You said,
     "Were you also aware..." No, I was not.
 5
 6
              You made it sound like I said yes to the
 7
     previous question.
 8
              The answer was No to that one and No to
     this one.
 9
10
              Okay, that's fine.
         0.
11
              It's all recorded. No big deal.
12
              Were you aware that on December the
13
     10th, 2015, that, again, speaking back to the
14
     other one, Cheryl McKeever referenced and read
15
     parts of the joint letter about the grievances in
16
     a meeting, making disparaging comments about
17
     employees?
              MS. BERNARD: Objection; asked and
18
19
         answered.
20
              You can answer again.
21
         Α.
              The answer is no.
22
              Were you aware that on December the
```

11th, 2015, Ms. Parish-Carter filed her second

discrimination charge with the District's EEO

23

24

25

office?

```
1
         Α.
              No.
              And equally were you aware that none of
 2
     those witnesses had ever been questioned?
 3
              I have no idea.
 4
         Α.
              January 6th of 2016, were you aware that
 5
 6
     a grievance report on behalf of all the teachers
     as it relates to Loretta Parish-Carter had filed
 7
     an EEO discrimination charge?
 8
 9
         Α.
              Can you say that again?
10
              You're saying that all the teachers
11
     collectively did that?
12
              I'm not following your question.
13
         Ο.
              Yes.
14
              Can you ask it again?
         Α.
15
         Q.
              I'm sorry...
16
              That a grievance was filed on January
17
     6th, not an EEO, a grievance was filed on behalf
18
     of all the teachers -- well, not all, but the
19
     teachers that were --
20
         Α.
              Impacted?
21
              No.
22
              Against McKeever and her administration?
         Q.
23
         Α.
              No.
24
              You weren't aware of that, okay.
         Q.
25
              May 25th, were you aware that Loretta
```

- 1 Parish-Carter filed a Charge of Discrimination
- 2 and Retaliation with the EEOC office in Miami?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. And then were you aware in June of 2016
- 5 she had requested a transfer and was refused?
- 6 A. Say that again.
- 7 Q. She had requested a transfer and was
- 8 refused?
- 9 A. This year?
- 10 O. June of 2016.
- 11 A. No, I'm not aware of that.
- 12 Q. But June of 2016 Cheryl McKeever was
- 13 reassigned to the School District; is that
- 14 correct?
- 15 A. Is that a question?
- 16 O. Yes.
- 17 A. Say that --
- 18 Q. Is it correct that in June of 2016
- 19 Cheryl McKeever was reassigned to the School
- 20 District?
- 21 A. I don't remember the exact month, but
- during the summer of 2016, because now she's
- 23 finishing a year. Yeah, so last summer, yes.
- Q. You stated previously that you
- 25 remembered meeting Malik Leigh at the District

- 1 meeting regarding the graduation and reducing --
- 2 increasing graduation rates and reducing
- 3 suspensions, correct?
- 4 A. Correct.
- Q. Okay.
- And you also stated that you remembered
- 7 when he accompanied his students to the School
- 8 Board meeting on March the 16th of 2016.
- 9 Were you aware, though, that on March
- 10 the 17th, Camille Coleman had requested from
- 11 Darron Davis to investigate him for an
- 12 unauthorized field trip to the School Board
- 13 meeting?
- MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 15 A. I wasn't aware of that.
- 16 Q. Do you remember during the School Board
- 17 meeting that one of the people on the panel had
- 18 sent Camille Coleman out to speak with Malik
- 19 Leigh and the students?
- A. What do you mean "on the panel"?
- 21 O. On like the...
- A. The dais?
- Q. Where you sit.
- A. So ask that again.
- Q. So were you aware that on March 17th

- 1 that Camille Coleman had requested Darron Davis
- 2 investigate Malik Leigh for an unauthorized field
- 3 trip to the School Board meeting.
- 4 A. That one I said no.
- 5 Q. So were you -- do you remember the
- 6 people on the panel requesting Camille Coleman to
- 7 go and speak with Malik Leigh and the students
- 8 that night on March 17?
- 9 A. It's not unusual for School Board
- 10 members to say after someone speaks, hey, make
- 11 sure that we follow-up with the issue that was
- 12 brought, because I think there may have even been
- some discussion on why is there -- why haven't we
- 14 found a teacher yet. It was late in the year or
- 15 maybe it was even -- but it was clearly a time of
- the year where there should have been stability
- 17 in the classroom.
- 18 So that's not uncommon.
- 19 Q. Were you aware that while outside
- 20 Camille Coleman berated both the students and
- 21 their parents --
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. -- for being in the School Board
- 24 meeting?
- 25 A. No. I was in the meeting, I wouldn't

```
1
     know that.
              I was in the meeting. You said she went
 2
     outside...
 3
              I'm saying after the fact someone could
 4
         0.
 5
     have made you aware of that.
 6
         Α.
              I'm not aware of that.
 7
         Q.
              And do you -- and so you weren't aware
     that Sonja Isger was also present for that
 8
 9
     berating?
10
              Sonja Isger, she writes for the Palm
     Beach Post. The original person that covered the
11
12
     story.
13
         Α.
              I don't remember.
14
              MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
15
              You stated, though, that you did
         0.
16
     remember on March the 18th, Malik Leigh sending
17
     you an e-mail regarding the fall-out retaliation
18
     after the School Board meeting, right?
19
              Which would be that letter there
20
     (indicating)?
21
         Α.
              No, I think what I said was I remember
22
     getting a letter. I don't remember the contents
23
     of it. We get a lot of these and that we forward
24
     them to legal and HR.
25
         Q.
              Okay.
```

```
1
              Were you made aware that in February --
     February 28th, that Malik Leigh and Joseph Lee
 2
     were communicating about creating a joint law
 3
 4
     camp?
              Law what?
 5
         Α.
 6
         Q.
              Law camp.
 7
         Α.
              No.
              Are you talking about Dr. Joseph Lee,
 8
     our School Board employee?
 9
10
         Ο.
              Yes.
11
              No, I did not know that.
         Α.
12
              And then on April the 4th, were you
         Q.
13
     aware that Joseph Lee accused Malik Leigh of
14
     misconduct for proposing that law camp?
15
         Α.
              No.
16
              And so equally you wouldn't know that
17
     even in the e-mail it specifically says, proposed
18
     law camp?
19
              MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
20
         Α.
              In this e-mail?
21
              No, in the e-mail -- an e-mail between
22
     Malik Leigh and Joseph Lee.
23
              I have no idea of what you're talking
         Α.
24
     about.
```

Are you aware of an April 8th, 2016

25

Q.

- 1 letter from Dianna Weinbaum accusing Malik Leigh
- 2 of misconduct for proposing a law camp?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. And then, of course, on April the 12th,
- 5 you remembered or possibly remember receiving
- 6 this letter right here (indicating), but you said
- 7 you sent that to the IG?
- 8 A. No, I wouldn't send this to the IG.
- 9 This letter -- and letters like this --
- 10 any time it comes from a lawyer, I would send it
- 11 to our general counsel and/or HR.
- MS. BERNARD: For the record, we're
- speaking of Plaintiff's Exhibit 1.
- MR. LEIGH: Plaintiff's Exhibit 1, I'm
- sorry.
- 16 Q. And after you submit it to whomever, you
- 17 have no idea what happens?
- 18 A. No.
- I mean, it's their responsibility to
- 20 follow up with any accusations, particularly when
- 21 it comes from a lawyer.
- 22 And most lawyers know to send it to
- 23 general counsel, rather than to the CEO.
- So I rarely get them. But when I do, I
- 25 always forward, from a lawyer, to our general

- 1 counsel.
- Q. Are you familiar -- so you're not
- 3 familiar with the Whistleblower Statute in
- 4 Florida?
- 5 MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 6 A. Our -- our whistleblower -- anything
- 7 that has to do with that section of whistleblower
- 8 would go to the IG.
- 9 Q. No, I mean the Whistleblower Statute for
- 10 the State of Florida, are you familiar with it?
- 11 A. Well, I mean, I'm familiar with the fact
- 12 that people have a whistleblower protection in
- 13 Florida.
- 14 Q. But you're not familiar with the Florida
- 15 Whistleblower Statute?
- 16 A. So I don't have -- I couldn't write out
- 17 for you what the statute is. But I can tell you
- 18 -- I mean, I know that we have that and that
- 19 we're required to -- and that's what the IG's
- 20 office primary responsibility is.
- 21 Q. So you wouldn't know that the
- 22 Whistleblower Statute specifically states that
- 23 any letter from a non-union teacher, you're
- 24 supposed to send it to both the superintendent
- 25 and/or the School Board? You wouldn't know that?

```
MS. BERNARD: You don't have to answer
 1
         that.
 2
              You can mark it. You can mark it.
 3
              It's a legal -- calls for a legal
 4
         conclusion.
 5
 6
              MR. LEIGH: This calls for knowledge of
 7
         whether or not he's actually read the
 8
         statute.
              MS. BERNARD: You can mark this. You can
 9
10
         mark it.
11
              MR. LEIGH: All right, all right, all
12
         right.
13
     By MR. LEIGH:
14
              Were you aware that on May the 1st Malik
15
     Leigh's position was posted as open while he was
16
     still working and not notified?
17
              I'm not aware of that.
18
              Do you know whether or not that is
19
    proper procedure or legal?
20
              MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
21
         Α.
              Principals and HR work together to post
22
    positions.
23
         0.
              Okay.
24
              There are times that positions are
25
     posted because the school is anticipating growth.
```

- 1 And sometimes like, so for example, it's
- 2 not uncommon for teachers to say, oh, my God,
- 3 they posted an English position but none of us
- 4 are leaving, why is there a vacancy?
- 5 Q. Sure.
- 6 A. So people would make the assumption that
- 7 means someone is being let go, when, in fact,
- 8 there are times where we know that that school
- 9 will have earned another teacher based on
- 10 enrollment projections.
- 11 So I don't know in this case why that
- 12 position was posted, but I was not aware of the
- 13 individual case that you just represented.
- 14 Q. But is it proper or policy to post an
- 15 employee's specific position as vacant, his own
- position as vacant while he's still working there
- 17 without notice?
- 18 MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 19 You can answer.
- 20 A. I don't know.
- 21 You're making an assumption that they
- 22 weren't adding another allocation to the school.
- 23 If it's a popular magnet program, is an
- 24 assumption being made that that's actually the
- 25 individual's position or not. I don't know that.

It's hypothetical. 1 Clearly it's best practice to say, look 2 we're -- you know, I'm not going to renew your 3 contract and I'm posting your position. 4 wouldn't want an individual to do that. 5 That's best practice. 6 7 I don't know of any policy that dictates 8 that. 9 So if it's best practice, but not Q. followed, there's no culpability behind that? 10 We would have to ask our legal and HR 11 Α. 12 folks about that, I don't know. 13 0. So are you familiar with -- do you know 14 -- are you familiar with the term "constructive" 15 termination"? 16 Α. No, never heard of it. 17 Never heard of it. Q. 18 Α. Construction... "Constructive termination." 19 Q. 20 Constructive, no. Α. 21 **Q**. Are you aware that on May the 3rd, 2016, 22 that the Office of Professional Standards had 23 accused Malik Leigh of using his teaching

position for financial gain and was breaking

Florida law and ethics?

24

25

- 1 A. No.
- I knew that there were a variety of
- 3 different pieces that they were looking into, but
- 4 I don't know that I heard that -- that I remember
- 5 that one specifically.
- 6 Q. What were those pieces?
- 7 A. That there were issues at the school,
- 8 that they were worried about a trend of an
- 9 individual who wasn't really meeting their
- 10 expectations as a teacher.
- 11 O. And where did this come from or who did
- 12 this come from?
- A. Well, it came from when -- that's when I
- 14 was made aware of it -- it came after sort of the
- 15 blow up when, you know, the kids had come to the
- 16 meeting, you had made some comments to the
- 17 newspaper I think, and then after that I heard,
- 18 hey, look, this is not a new issue, this is an
- 19 issue that we have been dealing with. There have
- 20 been other concerns throughout the year.
- 21 Q. But you don't remember who you heard
- 22 that from?
- 23 A. I heard it from folks in HR.
- 24 Q. Okay.
- 25 A. Dianna Weinbaum.

```
1
              But, again, there are investigators that
     work for her, so she may have been collecting
 2
     that information either on -- as a primary person
 3
     or maybe that was an individual below her that
 4
     was doing that.
 5
 6
         Q.
              Okay, okay.
 7
              Were you also aware that on May the 3rd
     that Malik Leigh had sent a Notice of Claim to
 8
     the Office of Professional Standards in a
 9
10
     response letter?
11
              Was I aware that you made a Notice of
         Α.
12
     Claim...
13
         Ο.
              Correct.
14
         Α.
             To whom?
15
              To the Office of Professional Standards.
         Q.
16
         Α.
              No.
17
              Were you aware that on May the 12th,
         Q.
18
     2016, that Malik Leigh had finally received his
19
     non-renewal letter?
20
         A.
              No.
21
              Were you aware that on May the 17th,
22
     Malik Leigh was called and ordered to a morning
23
     meeting on May the 18th, 2016 where he was
24
     suspended and sent home?
```

25

Α.

No.

```
1
              Well, wait a minute.
              Say that again.
 2
              So the question before you said May
 3
 4
     17th?
 5
         0.
              Correct.
              And then you're saying then on May 18th
 6
 7
     was I aware that you were called into a
 8
     meeting...
 9
         Q. I will reread the question.
10
         Α.
              Yeah, sorry.
              Were you aware that on May the 17th,
11
         Q.
12
     Malik Leigh was called and ordered to a morning
13
     meeting to occur on May the 18th, 2016, where he
14
     was suspended and sent home?
15
         Α.
              No, I was not aware of that.
16
              I was aware that a suspension was
     pending and then found out later that that had
17
18
     occurred.
19
              I wasn't aware of a letter or a meeting
20
     the next morning. I didn't know about the
21
     specifics or the details.
22
              So you were made aware that a suspension
23
     was pending prior to Malik Leigh being called?
24
         Α.
              No.
```

Meaning that -- so I didn't know about

25

- 1 the fact that you got an e-mail on the 17th to go
- 2 to the 18th to be suspended.
- Q. Okay.
- 4 A. But I knew that there were concerns and
- 5 pending decisions that needed to be made that
- 6 might include suspension, it might include a
- 7 termination. I didn't know what the end result
- 8 was going to be.
- 9 But that there was some pending decision
- 10 that needed to be made.
- 11 Q. Okay.
- 12 So then prior to 2017 -- or, excuse me,
- prior to May 17th, what would be a reason for the
- 14 suspension or for a suspension?
- MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 16 A. I don't think -- maybe I didn't make
- 17 myself clear.
- 18 So I had no idea that you got an e-mail
- 19 saying -- from May 17th, come the next morning to
- 20 a May 18th meeting.
- 21 O. Sure.
- 22 A. I knew that there was an investigation
- 23 that was occurring and that at some point a
- 24 decision was going to need to be made about what
- 25 we were going to do with Malik.

- 1 Q. Okay.
- 2 A. Okay?
- 3 Which might have included suspension, it
- 4 might have included something else, I didn't know
- 5 that.
- 6 Q. But you were only made aware of anything
- 7 that had to do with Malik Leigh after March the
- 8 16th, 2016?
- 9 MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 10 A. Typically what happens is, you know, I'm
- 11 made aware that, you know... again, depending on
- 12 the situation.
- If a person is being terminated... I'm
- 14 not always made aware of probationary people that
- 15 are being suspended.
- 16 Q. That's not the question.
- 17 The question that I made -- I got that
- 18 part because you said it a second ago.
- 19 The question that I was making was: But
- 20 you were only made aware that there were any kind
- 21 of issues regarding Malik Leigh until after the
- 22 School Board meeting?
- 23 A. Yes.
- So like issues that may have happened in
- 25 August, September, I wouldn't have been told

- 1 that. There are so many times that that stuff
- 2 happens across the District. I was only brought
- 3 into the situation after it sort of, to use the
- 4 term, like sort of blew up where all of a sudden
- 5 the newspaper is asking questions, the Board is
- 6 asking questions, that's when I was made aware of
- 7 it.
- 8 Q. So the name was circulating around to
- 9 the point where you were able to notice it after
- 10 March the 16th?
- 11 A. I don't remember the date, but it was
- 12 after...
- Q. After the School Board meeting?
- 14 A. After the School Board meeting.
- 15 Q. Okay.
- But you don't know who it came from?
- 17 A. I don't know...
- 18 O. You don't know where the swirl came
- 19 from?
- 20 A. No.
- I mean, the swirl came from the incident
- 22 at the School Board meeting. The... I guess a
- 23 couple of articles maybe that had come out... I
- 24 don't remember if it was a television or a
- 25 newspaper article.

```
1 Q. Sure.
```

- 2 A. And then when Dianna Weinbaum said,
- 3 hey...
- I said, so, you know, what's going on or
- 5 whatever...
- 6 And she said, this is not the first
- 7 issue. We have had other issues or other issues
- 8 had been reported I guess that maybe you had been
- 9 struggling with different things at the school.
- 10 I don't know. I don't remember ever
- 11 seeing that. No one ever told me that.
- 12 O. Sure.
- 13 A. But that was, that was after that Board
- 14 meeting.
- 15 Q. Got you, okay.
- 16 And then on May the 19th, you remember
- 17 going on tv and speaking about Malik Leigh; is
- 18 that correct?
- 19 A. I'm not saying it didn't happen. I
- 20 don't remember exactly -- I would have to go back
- 21 and look at what the date was.
- But it's not uncommon for me to speak on
- 23 behalf of the Board on situations that are
- 24 occurring.
- 25 Q. And then you were -- were you aware that

- 1 on May the 20th, 2016, Malik Leigh filed an EEOC
- 2 Charge of Discrimination and Retaliation against
- 3 the School District?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. And then on May 24th were you made aware
- 6 that Malik Leigh was terminated?
- 7 A. I don't know the date, but I was made
- 8 aware that there was a termination.
- 9 Q. Okay.
- 10 And was that termination made by
- 11 yourself or the Board?
- 12 A. So that's a really good question.
- So terminations are made by
- 14 administration and then, depending on if it's a
- 15 probationary individual or if it's somebody who
- 16 has additional grievance rights, it has other
- 17 steps which might include going to the School
- 18 Board.
- 19 But not probationary period.
- 20 So I would argue that a probationary is
- 21 a non-renewal -- you called it a termination -- a
- 22 non-renewal would not go to the School Board for
- 23 approval.
- Q. Would a termination go to the School
- 25 Board?

- 1 A. So we bring the School Board reports of
- 2 termination and retirements, et cetera, each
- 3 month, so, yeah, that would go to the School
- 4 Board.
- 5 Q. So then would it have gone to the School
- 6 Board prior to May the 24th?
- 7 A. I don't... we would have to... I don't
- 8 know. I don't know if temporary employee
- 9 non-renewals go to the Board for approval. I
- 10 don't know that answer.
- 11 Q. But you would agree that there's a
- 12 significant difference between a termination and
- 13 a non-renewal?
- 14 A. For a probationary period, there's a
- 15 significant difference between a non-renewal and
- 16 a termination.
- 17 Q. For anybody is there a significant
- 18 difference between a termination and a
- 19 non-renewal?
- 20 A. I think there's a difference.
- 21 Q. So just to make sure it's clear --
- MR. LEIGH: And you can object and
- 23 that's fine.
- 24 Q. -- you said that there is no difference
- 25 between a probationary employee -- there is no

- 1 difference between a termination and a
- 2 non-renewal with a probationary employee?
- 3 MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
- 4 A. I'm sorry, can you ask the question
- 5 again?
- 6 Q. Maybe I just didn't hear it when you
- 7 gave the answer. I'm just reasking to make sure
- 8 -- I'm trying to clarify.
- 9 You stated that there is a difference
- 10 between a non-renewal and a termination as it
- 11 relates to an annual employee, you said there is
- 12 a difference between the two?
- 13 A. Probationary employee, non-renewal and
- 14 termination, I think there's a difference between
- 15 the two.
- 16 Q. Okay, okay.
- 17 And so -- and all terminations have to
- 18 be -- an actual termination termination has to be
- 19 approved by the Board?
- 20 A. It goes to the Board... or goes to the
- 21 Board... it goes to the Board for approval.
- But, remember, there's also other
- 23 processes besides the Board.
- 24 And sometimes that means that that
- 25 individual actually goes before the Board and

- 1 says to them, I'm being terminated and I don't
- 2 think it's appropriate. And then the Board has
- 3 to vote up or down.
- 4 So, like, for example, on suspensions
- 5 with pay, that has to go to the School Board. If
- 6 I -- I'm sorry, suspensions without pay. I
- 7 apologize.
- 8 So if I want to suspend an employee for
- 9 ten days without pay, the Board has to approve or
- 10 not approve that.
- 11 O. Uh-huh.
- 12 A. On non-renewals is completely different.
- 13 That doesn't go to the Board for approval.
- 14 Q. Right, okay.
- 15 Is there a significant difference
- 16 between a suspension and a reassignment?
- 17 A. Is there a difference between a
- 18 suspension and reassignment?
- 19 Yeah, suspension is you can't come to
- 20 work, sometimes it's with pay, sometimes it's
- 21 without.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- A. And then a reassignment is, hey, you
- 24 can't work at this school, but we will give you
- 25 an opportunity to work somewhere else.

```
1
              Is that what you mean?
         Q.
              I'm just asking...
 2
              That's how I understand it.
 3
         Α.
              And so are suspensions -- to the best of
 4
         Ο.
     your knowledge, is there a State statute or rule
 5
 6
     on how a school district can suspend an employee?
              Say that again.
 7
              To the best of your knowledge, is there
 8
         0.
     a State rule or guideline that states how a
 9
10
     school district can suspend an employee?
11
              You know, that's one of the reasons why
         Α.
12
     we have a legal team internally.
13
              I don't know that I -- I can't recall
14
     knowing a State law.
15
              I know that we have our own internal
16
     policies and union contracts that guide that.
17
         Q.
              Okay.
              Actually, hold on.
18
         Α.
19
              I had one other piece that I know of.
20
              State statute does require me getting
21
     Board approval for unpaid suspensions.
22
              So a paid suspension does not need Board
23
     approval?
24
              To my knowledge.
         Α.
```

And absent an enumerated set of

25

Ο.

```
1 circumstances, are all suspensions or
```

- 2 disciplinary actions, are they all supposed to
- 3 follow progressive punishment?
- 4 A. It depends.
- 5 Q. So my question was outside of an
- 6 enumerated set of circumstances...
- 7 So if you have a guy that's taking
- 8 pictures of girls in the locker room, you're
- 9 going to get rid of that guy pretty quick,
- 10 correct?
- 11 You're probably not going to...
- 12 Let me back up.
- 13 A. No.
- 14 If you look at our union contract for
- 15 individuals that are beyond probation, the
- 16 threshold is a little more complicated. I would
- 17 say yes on the outset I would get rid of the
- 18 person who is taking pictures in the locker room.
- 19 Q. Right.
- 20 A. But there's -- they have an opportunity
- 21 to go to an administrative law judge and in some
- 22 cases the administrative law judge will say --
- 23 they will overrule our termination.
- So it's not that easy.
- Q. Do all employees -- do probationary

```
1 employees get due process rights?
```

- 2 A. We have due process for all employees.
- 3 They have a right to share their thoughts and
- 4 ideas to make complaints.
- 5 I'm not aware of any delineation between
- 6 those two.
- 7 Q. So can an employee be terminated or
- 8 suspended prior to -- in fact, let me back up.
- 9 Can an employee who is facing suspension
- 10 or termination be denied an administrative
- 11 hearing if they request one?
- MS. BERNARD: I'm just going to object
- to the form. Outside of the purview of this
- 14 witness. Lack of foundation.
- 15 Q. You can go ahead and answer it.
- 16 A. No.
- 17 Q. So they cannot be denied an
- 18 administrative hearing?
- 19 A. I'm sorry, I don't know.
- 20 Q. You don't know, okay.
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. Do you know whether or not they --
- 23 because you have testified or done a deposition
- 24 or testified in an administrative hearing before,
- 25 correct?

```
1 A. Yeah.
```

- 2 Q. So, to the best of your knowledge, that
- 3 administrative hearing just followed the normal
- 4 flow?
- 5 A. Yeah, of the way it was set up in
- 6 Georgia.
- 7 Q. So it was in Georgia. I don't think I
- 8 even asked you that, okay.
- 9 But, as far as Florida, you're not a
- 10 hundred percent sure as far as how the
- 11 administrative process works?
- 12 A. The administrative law judge process?
- 13 Q. Just the administrative process.
- 14 Like if the School District decides to
- impose some form of punishment, it's generally
- 16 outside of an enumerated set of circumstances, it
- is generally supposed to flow a particular way.
- 18 A. Right, I'm aware of that. And we have a
- 19 had a couple of those.
- I haven't been personally deposed or
- 21 gone to them, but I'm aware of them and I
- 22 understand how they work.
- And we have also had some that supported
- 24 us and some that didn't.
- 25 Q. Right, okay.

- But at least A to Z is supposed to go
- 2 down that route, outside of extreme
- 3 circumstances...
- 4 A. So I'm familiar with that.
- 5 Q. So the issue with Malik Leigh's exam,
- 6 would that fall outside of the extreme
- 7 circumstances?
- 8 A. I can't answer that. I'm not the
- 9 principal of that school. I don't have primary
- 10 knowledge of every bit and piece that went into
- 11 that decision.
- 12 Q. Okay.
- 13 A. So I don't know.
- 14 Q. When Dianna Weinbaum told you that we
- 15 had had previous issues with Malik Leigh, did you
- 16 ask what those issues were?
- 17 A. I mean, I think she brought forward a
- 18 couple of examples. I don't remember every
- 19 single one of the examples, but I remember it...
- 20 sort of around this idea of a theme of, you know,
- 21 a theme of not -- not working to follow sort of
- the protocols and rituals of the schools.
- But I can't give you any examples.
- But it was just sort of a general, we
- 25 have had issues with this individual before.

```
1 Q. And prior to coming here, had you looked
```

- 2 into Malik Leigh's personnel file?
- 3 A. Have I?
- 4 O. Yes.
- 5 A. Not the file.
- 6 Q. Anything?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. Like my social media or anything?
- 9 A. Actually I think we were connected at
- 10 one point and I think I blocked you because of
- 11 inappropriate social media.
- 12 Q. Okay. Really? Okay.
- When you were in Georgia, okay, would
- 14 you say that you worked positively or negatively
- 15 with union members -- teachers union members?
- 16 A. We didn't have a union. We had a
- 17 teacher association.
- 18 There was one small group of... teacher
- 19 group called MACE that had a couple of negative
- 20 things to say about every superintendent and
- 21 every principal in the region.
- But we didn't really have unions; it was
- 23 an association.
- Q. Was there a union before you got there?
- 25 A. No, there's been -- Georgia doesn't have

- 1 -- they only have associations.
- No, actually -- but of the two
- 3 associations there, I had good working
- 4 relationships with both of them.
- 5 I had one group that really disliked
- 6 pretty much everybody, but it was a rogue group
- 7 called MACE, M-A-C-E.
- 8 Q. Would you say that there were any
- 9 policies that you had left on -- that you
- 10 promoted or introduced while in
- 11 Charlotte-Mecklenburg that promoted the
- 12 resegregation of schools?
- 13 A. In Charlotte?
- 14 Q. In Charlotte, yes.
- 15 A. So I had no authority in that region or
- 16 decision making about that.
- 17 Q. Okay.
- 18 A. Although there was a legal battle that
- 19 occurred that actually had been on more than one
- 20 occasion lifted up as the reason schools were
- 21 resegregated because Charlotte had led the way on
- 22 desegregation.
- 23 Q. Right.
- A. And the opposite lawsuit was filed back
- 25 to home schools and it caused a massive

```
disruption.
 1
              But that was before 2006.
 2
              Maybe 1999?
 3
         0.
              Probably right around the turn -- yeah,
 4
         Α.
 5
     you're probably right.
 6
              And are you familiar with that case in
 7
     Charlotte-Mecklenburg that was...
              Mecklenburg versus Board of Ed?
 8
         Α.
 9
         Q.
              Okay.
10
              Is that the one you're talking about?
         Α.
11
              I'm not sure about that one.
         Q.
12
              But Swann versus
13
     Charlotte-Mecklenburg...
14
         Α.
              Yeah.
15
              And the issue in that case --
         Q.
16
              MR. LEIGH: Oh, I know you're going to
17
         object to that. I know I would.
18
              Now, would you say the efforts to
19
     resegregate the School District in Charlotte
20
     mirrors the efforts to promote segregation here
     in Palm Beach?
21
22
              MS. BERNARD: Object to the form. Calls
23
         for a legal conclusion.
24
              I'm not sure that I would say that there
25
     are efforts in this District to resegregate
```

```
schools.
 1
              Well, I meant -- not to resegregate --
 2
     to promote the segregation of schools?
 3
              To promote segregation of schools?
 4
         Α.
 5
         0.
              Yeah.
 6
         Α.
              I'm not aware of any effort to segregate
 7
     schools.
 8
         Q.
              Okay.
              Are you familiar with the history of
 9
     Palm Beach County segregated schools?
10
11
         Α.
              I am.
12
              Dr. Robinson has given me a history
13
     lesson on the segregation of schools in Palm
14
     Beach.
15
              And then is it against school policy for
         0.
16
     principals to sell their personal items for
17
     profit on school grounds using school resources,
18
     like Internet, board rooms, stuff like that?
19
         Α.
              To sell what?
20
              Their own personal items and effects for
         Q.
     profit.
21
22
         Α.
              While at work?
23
              While at work and using the school
         0.
24
     resources to do so.
25
              That wouldn't be appropriate for any
         Α.
```

- 1 employee.
- 2 Q. But a school principal, would that be
- 3 appropriate?
- 4 A. It's inappropriate for any employee,
- 5 whether you're a bus driver, custodian or
- 6 superintendent.
- 7 Q. Should that principal receive some form
- 8 of discipline or at least a speaking to?
- 9 A. I mean, if an individual complaint is
- 10 founded, then, you know, I would be leaning on HR
- 11 to say how have we dealt with that in the past.
- 12 Q. And when you say "in the past," how far
- 13 back is the past?
- A. Well, I mean, usually our HR officials
- 15 have, you know, practices that they -- and
- 16 procedures that they uphold -- right? -- so you
- don't go from one side of the road to the other
- 18 making decisions about similar issues.
- 19 Q. So you're saying however something has
- 20 generally occurred, as long as it's relatively
- 21 positive for the District, let's maintain and
- 22 continue that tradition?
- 23 A. No.
- I mean, I have made some small changes.
- 25 I'm not just going to rely on the past practice.

```
1
         Q.
              Sure.
              So you might use it to help judge
 2
     somewhat, you know, so we don't go too far
 3
     outside the normal practice.
 4
              But there are times that I'm willing to
 5
 6
     do that as an individual, if I can.
 7
         Q.
              Okay.
              Would you consider a teacher that is
 8
     darker skinned retaliating against another
 9
10
     teacher that is lighter skinned, for no reason
     other than they are just lighter skinned, as
11
     racial retaliation?
12
13
              MS. BERNARD: Object to the form.
14
              Calls for a legal conclusion.
15
              I'm not really sure I even understand
         Α.
16
     the question.
              You mean both individuals are of
17
     African-American or black?
18
```

- 19 O. Yes.
- 20 A. One is darker skinned and one is lighter
- 21 skinned and if they what?
- Q. And one of the purposes for retaliating
- 23 against that lighter-skinned person is just the
- 24 fact that they are a lighter-skinned person?
- MS. BERNARD: Same objection.

```
1 A. Yeah, I don't know.
```

- 2 Q. But if that was a white person that were
- 3 discriminating against a black person, then
- 4 that's a little bit easier to discern you think?
- 5 MS. BERNARD: Same objection.
- 6 A. All right.
- 7 So you're saying... ask the second one
- 8 again. I don't know that I'm following your
- 9 logic.
- 10 Q. First one you're not quite following,
- 11 but the second one is a little bit easier to
- 12 understand, white person -- clearly white person
- 13 that is retaliating against a black person,
- 14 clearly black person.
- 15 A. Because they are black?
- 16 Q. Because they are black, yes.
- MS. BERNARD: And what's the question?
- 18 Q. The original question was: Do you
- 19 consider that to be racial retaliation?
- MS. BERNARD: Oh, okay, so there's the
- 21 question.
- MR. LEIGH: It was in the first one.
- 23 A. So I have read about the issue within
- 24 the African-American community, the tension that
- 25 exists between darker-skinned individuals and

```
1 lighter skinned, those who assimilate more to
```

- 2 sort of mainstream Caucasian, language and music
- 3 and hair, et cetera, I have read about that. I
- 4 don't know about it. But, I mean, I have read
- 5 about it, but I don't know about it in the sense
- 6 that I clearly understand all the nuance of that.
- 7 I think it's easier to see right from
- 8 the fifty thousand foot view discrimination
- 9 occurring and things that are a little crisper
- 10 and cleaner, like you're Hispanic and you're
- 11 African-American or you're white and your Chinese
- 12 or whatever, that makes it a little simpler.
- I think racism can occur within one's
- 14 own race. I mean, I can give you an example of
- 15 my own country, where in southern Italy versus
- 16 northern Italy... you have got where I'm from in
- the south where people are a little darker
- 18 skinned and work in the countryside, they
- 19 actually got names for that that are very
- 20 derogatory, even though they are of the same
- 21 race.
- 22 Q. Right.
- A. So I know that there's tension that
- 24 exists within race.
- 25 Q. Okay.

```
1
              But as it relates to an employment
     situation, okay, would you consider that
 2
     retaliation to be the same -- to be classified
 3
     the same way as racial discrimination?
 4
 5
         Α.
              I would have to lean on the judges
     and the experts to say whether or not that
 6
 7
     occurred.
              Could it occur?
 8
 9
              I quess it could occur.
10
              MR. LEIGH: And then that should be it.
11
              We are done. That will be all.
12
              No further questions, I'm sorry.
13
              MS. BERNARD: All right. I don't have
14
         any questions actually.
15
              So with that being said, did you want to
16
         go over the reading and the waiving?
17
              MR. LEIGH: At the end of the deposition
18
         you have an opportunity to get a copy of
19
         anything and everything that you have stated
20
         and to sign off as being the true and
21
         actual...
22
              So if you want, you can tell her to say,
23
         yes, I would like to read it before I submit
24
         it or no, I will waive it.
25
              THE WITNESS: Yeah, I would like to read
```

```
it.
 1
          MR. LEIGH: Sounds good.
 2
          (Witness excused.)
 3
          (Deposition concluded.)
 4
 5
 6
 7
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

1	CERTIFICATE OF OATH
2	
3	THE STATE OF FLORIDA)
4	COUNTY OF PALM BEACH)
5	
6	I, ANN MARIE PLEASANTON, Registered
7	Professional Reporter, Florida Professional Reporter,
8	Notary Public, State of Florida, certify that ROBERT
9	AVOSSA, ED.D., personally appeared before me and was
10	duly sworn on the 8th day of June, 2017.
11	
12	WITNESS my hand and official seal this
13	day of June, 2017.
14	ANN MARIE PLEASANTON MY COMMISSION # EE 198128 EXPIRES: July 20, 2016
15	Bonded Thru Budget Notary Services
16 17	AnPlasanton
18	ANN MARIE PLEASANTON, RPR, FPR
19	Notary Public, State of Florida
20	
21	Personally known: X
22	Produced identification:
23	
24	
25	

1	CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER
2	THE STATE OF FLORIDA) COUNTY OF PALM BEACH)
3	, and the second se
4	I, ANN MARIE PLEASANTON, Registered Professional Reporter, Florida Professional Reporter, certify that I was authorized to and
5	did stenographically report the deposition of ROBERT AVOSSA, ED.D., that a review of the
6	transcript was requested; and that the transcript, Pages 1 through 258, is a true and
7	complete record of my stenographic notes.
8	I further certify that I am not a
9	relative, employee, attorney, or counsel of any of the parties, nor am I a relative or employee
LO	of any of the parties' attorney or counsel connected with the action, nor am I financially
L1	interested in the action.
12	The certification does not apply to any
13 14	reproduction of the same by any means unless under the direct control and/or direction of the reporter.
15 16	Dated this 18th day of June, 2017.
17	
- <i>-</i> 18	
19	AnPlasanton
20	ANN MARIE PLEASANTON, RPR, FPR
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
45	

```
1
 2
 3
 4
     Shawntoyia Bernard, Esq.
     SCHOOL BOARD OF PALM BEACH COUNTY
 5
     Office of the General Counsel
     3300 Forest Hill Boulevard
 6
     Suite C-323
 7
    West Palm Beach, Florida 33406
 8
     June 18, 2017
 9
             Leigh/Abrams-Jackson/Parish-Carter vs. PBCSB
10
11
     Dear Ms. Bernard:
12
     For your convenience, attached hereto you will
13
     find Errata Sheets for the use of Robert Avossa,
     Ed.D., in entering any changes to the deposition.
14
     Please photocopy the executed documents and
15
     forward a copy of the executed documents to all
     parties involved in this matter for placement in
16
     the transcript.
17
     If no changes are to be noted, please indicate
     that on the Errata Sheet and forward a copy to
18
     all parties so they may be advised that no
     changes were made.
19
     We find that the above procedure facilitates
20
     handling of signature matters and puts the
     necessary documents directly into the hands of
21
     all parties.
                     Cordially yours,
22
23
24
                     Ann Marie Pleasanton, R.P.R., F,P.R.
25
     cc:
          Malik Leigh, Esq.
          Danielle Watson, Esq.
```

			ERR	ATA SH	EET		
Leigl			9:16-	CV-816	12/8162	r vs. PB 4/81623	CSB
			June	8, 20	16		
DO NOT	WRITE	ON I	RANSCR	IPT -	- ENTER	CHANGES	HERE
Page: _			Line:				
Should	read:						
Reason	for Ch	nange	:			_	
Page: _			Line:				
Now rea	ids:						
Should	read:						
Reason	for Ch	nange	:			_	
Page: _ Now rea			Line:				
Should	read:						
Reason	for Ch	nange	:			_	
Page: _ Now rea	ads:		Line:				
Should	read:						
Reason	for Ch	nange	: :			_	
have re	ead my ny char	fore	going	transc	ript an	e that I d, toget ts state	her



















